



Town of Barnstable

Zoning Board of Appeals



Board Members:

Alex Rodolakis – Chair David Hirsch – Vice Chair Herbert Bodensiek - Clerk
 Jacob Dewey – Regular Member Paul Pinard – Regular Member
 Todd Walantis – Associate Member Mark Hansen – Associate Member
 James Tinsley – Town Council Liaison

Staff Support

Elizabeth Jenkins – Director - elizabeth.jenkins@town.barnstable.ma.us
 Anna Brigham – Principal Planner – anna.brigham@town.barnstable.ma.us
 Carol Puckett – Administrative Assistant – carol.puckett@town.barnstable.ma.us

19 SEP 24 PM 2:05

BARNSTABLE
TOWN CLERK

Minutes

Wednesday, May 22, 2019

Hearing Room – 2nd Floor – 367 Main Street, Hyannis, MA

Alex Rodolakis - Chair	Present
David Hirsch – Vice Chair	Present
Herbert Bodensiek – Clerk	Present
Jacob Dewey – Regular Member	Absent
Paul Pinard – Regular Member	Present
Todd Walantis – Associate Member	Absent
Mark Hansen – Associate Member	Present
Robert Twiss – Associate Member	Present
Vacant	

Also present were Anna Brigham – Principal Planner and Carol Puckett – Administrative Assistant

As a quorum has been met, Alex Rodolakis opens the hearing at 7:01 PM

Call to Order

Introduction of Board Members – *All members present introduce themselves.*

Alex reads the following into the record with no response:

Notice of Recording

Please note that this meeting is recorded and broadcast on Channel 18 and in accordance with MGL Chapter 30A §20. I must inquire whether anyone is taping this meeting and to please make their presence known.

Minutes

March 13, 2019

Motion to approve the March 13, 2019 minutes as submitted is made by Mark Hansen and seconded by Paul Pinard

Vote:

All in favor

Alex reads the following into the record:

Old Business

7:00 PM

Appeal No. 2019-025

Riedell

Sharon E. Riedell, as Trustee, has applied for a Special Permit in accordance with Section 240-93.B – Nonconforming Building or Structures Not Used as Single or Two-Family Residences. The Applicant is proposing to demolish an existing accessory structure (garage) and construct a new, 34’x34’ garage approximately 11 feet from the front setback along Tower Hill Road. The subject property is located at 778 Main Street, Osterville, MA as shown on Assessor’s Map 117 as parcel 084. It is located in the Business A (BA) Zoning District.

Continued from May 8, 2019. No members assigned. No testimony taken

Members assigned tonight: Alex Rodolakis, David Hirsch, Herb Bodensiek, Paul Pinard, Mark Hansen

Representative: Michael Schulz, Esq.

Materials submitted since application:

- Letter dated May 7, 2019 requesting continuance from May 8th to May 22nd
- Memo dated May 17, 2019 from Attorney Michael Schulz, pages labeled 1 through 8 with Exhibits 1-5.

Staff report originally dated April 22, 2019, revised May 3, 2019

Attorney Michael Schulz is seeking special permit to reconstruct a garage and shift it to the northerly corner of the lot. The size of the new garage will also be smaller. Attorney Schulz gives a history of the property including the purchase in 1983 by Sharon Riedell as trustee. Principal dwelling dates to the 1920's with additions in the early 80's when purchased. However, the garage is in a dilapidated state. The proposed garage is shown on a plan drawn by Sullivan Engineering and reducing 11 feet along Tower Hill Road. It has gone through Site Plan Review (SPR) and has approval. There has been a discussion with David Anthony – Director of Risk and Property Management Department regarding parking in the town layout. He states that there is a license requirement for the parking within the town layout which is in process.

In response to questions from the board members, Attorney Schulz states that the retaining wall on the Tower Hill Road side will be replaced and the height of the garage will be under the thirty (30) foot requirement. Alex comments that the Town Hill Road side lacks landscaping and asks if there is a need for fencing. Attorney Schulz states that there was a new site plan with improvements and that this will be a seamless transition. Alex & Mark ask about parking. Attorney Schulz states that there are no plans for a lease for after hours parking with the adjacent soft serve ice cream business.

Alex opens for public comment.

Jim McGillen of 39 Tower Hill Road, Osterville abuts and looks down on this property. He has lived there for about a year and states that the present use is not disruptive, and they are not trying to expand any use. He states that the current roof of the garage is in terrible condition and a new roof and any improvements to the garage will be vastly appreciated and is in support of this request.

The board deliberates. Paul Pinard clarifies with Attorney Schulz that the new height of the garage will be taller than the existing structure. Mark McAllister explains that the grade at Main Street is approximately eleven (11) feet to plate but that the intent is to go up one story. Overall, the new structure will be approximately nine (9) feet higher than the existing garage. Also, the retaining wall be engineered concrete and a guardrail installed.

Paul Pinard makes findings:

Special Permit Findings

For all Special Permits, the Board is required to make general findings pursuant to § 240-125(C). The Board should review the evidence presented by the Applicant, staff, and members of the public and, after weighing such evidence, is encouraged to articulate if and how the evidence contributes to each of the required findings.

1. **The application falls within a category specifically excepted in the ordinance for a grant of a special permit. The existing use is pre-existing nonconforming and any expansion/alteration is allowed under Section 240-93. existing use is preexisting NC and any expansion is allowed under 240-93**
2. **After an evaluation of all the evidence presented, the proposal fulfills the spirit and intent of the Zoning Ordinance and would not represent a substantial detriment to the public good or the neighborhood affected.. he finds that it is not a detriment to the public good and through testimony from abutter**
3. **A Site Plan has been reviewed and found approvable with conditions (See letter dated April 5, 2019).**
Further, Section 240-93 B. requires the Board to find that:
4. **The proposed repairs, alterations and/or expansion are not substantially more detrimental to the surrounding neighborhood. He finds that it is not.**

Vote:

All in favor

Paul Pinard makes a motion to grant the relief being sought with the following conditions:

Conditions

1. Special Permit No. 2019-025 is granted to Sharron E. Riedell to demolish an existing accessory structure (garage) and construct a new, 34'x34' garage approximately 11 feet from the front setback along Tower Hill Road. The property is located at 778 Main Street, Osterville, MA.
2. The improvements shall be in substantial conformance with the plan entitled "Site Plan Proposed Improvements at 778 Main Street Barnstable (Osterville) Mass" by CapeSurv and Sullivan Engineering & Consulting, Inc., dated March 24, 2019.
3. The Applicant is required to attain all required permits, approvals, and licenses for the proposed new expansion/alteration.

4. Prior to final permitting with the Building Department, the applicant must obtain a license from the Town Manager granting permission to locate parking spaces within the layout of Tower Road and Main Street as shown on plan entitled 'Site Plan Proposed Improvements at 778 Main Street Barnstable (Osterville) Mass' by CapeSurv and Sullivan Engineering & Consulting, Inc., dated March 24, 2019.
5. Site Plan Review conditions of approval in the letter dated April 5, 2019 are hereby incorporated into this Decision.
6. The decision shall be recorded at the Barnstable County Registry of Deeds and copies of the recorded decision shall be submitted to the Zoning Board of Appeals Office and the Building Division prior to issuance building permit. The rights authorized by this special permit must be exercised within two years, unless extended.

Paul Pinard asks Attorney Schulz if he has seen the conditions. Attorney Schulz answers yes.

Vote:

All in favor

GRANTED WITH CONDITIONS

New Business

7:00 PM

Appeal No. 2019-027

Kinlin

Robert B. and Kate Elizabeth Kinlin, Jr., have applied for a Special Permit in accordance with Section 240-91.H(3) - Nonconforming Lot. The Applicants are proposing to demolish an existing accessory structure (garage) and construct a new, 18'X30' garage in approximately the same location. The subject property is located at 142 Fifth Avenue, Hyannis, MA as shown on Assessor's Map 245 as parcel 113. It is located in the Residence B (RB) Zoning District.

Members assigned tonight: Alex Rodolakis, David Hirsch, Herb Bodensiek, Paul Pinard, Robert Twiss

Representative: Arlene Wilson from A.M. Wilson and Associates.

Arlene Wilson states that Mr. Kinlin wants to demolish the existing garage and construct a new, smaller one in basically the same footprint. The new garage will be parallel and two feet from the property line. The property has been reviewed by the Barnstable Historical Commission which found no historical significance. The proposed plan meets lot coverage and floor area ratio. She understands that the abutter to the east of this parcel has some concerns one of which is that the lot line on the Assessor's record shows that the garage is on that line. However, Ms. Wilson explains that the Assessor's record cannot be used for property line placement. She hands in a survey plan (Exhibit A) showing the Kinlin and abutter's property (Horn) so that you can see how the two properties relate to one another. She refers to a comment from Mr. Horn in his letter which states that the garage is only 34 inches from the property line. She comments that she isn't sure where that figure came from and that the dimensions stated on the plan are accurate. She also notes that in the letter, Mr. Horn suggested that the new garage could be moved towards the house and perhaps attached. Even if they attached the garage, Ms. Wilson states that it would still not meet the requirement for side yard setbacks in that zoning district. She also notes that Mr. Horn had concerns about trash cans on that side of the property facing him and doesn't believe that it should be a concern or problem brought to the Zoning Board. She notes that the Horn's have demolished, raised and rebuilt their house and in doing so removed the vegetated buffer between the two lots. She believes that the new garage would be an asset and will coordinate with the older homes in the neighborhood. The total height of the proposed garage will be a little less than 16 feet.

Paul Pinard asks to go over the dimensions of the existing and proposed garage. Ms. Wilson says that it is 31 feet long, the new garage is a bit smaller and the tree in the back will stay. Robert Twiss asks if the trash cans are on the property line and if there would be another place to put the barrels. Wilson can look into that.

Alex asks for public comment.

John Horn, an abutter on the east side, speaks and notes that he had also submitted a letter of concern. He states that his property has been in the family for about 100 years, has lived there seasonally for 65 years and has also rebuilt the house. He is concerned. He states that the Assessor's map shows that the garage is on their property line and that he has had it surveyed also and that the measurement is 34 inches and very close to his property. He has also spoken with Mr. Kinlin who stated that they wouldn't move the barrels and that they are kept on his property. Mr. Horn's preference would be that the new garage be moved over towards the house in order to give him more room and shall not be placed any closer than what is there. He notes, that included in his letter, are pictures of unsightly trash that has escaped and is concerned about trash on his property.

Ms. Wilson rebuts and states that to the extent that they have something on the property, it will be taken away. Also, the existing garage has been there for approximately 100 years, the proposal is not to put it any closer than where it is now, and trying to attach it to the existing home would be an architectural problem.

Alex asks about putting in a trash shed.

Rob Kinlin speaks and states that they have trash pick-up service and that this is a tight lot and putting the trash in the garage would be a problem because when it rains it goes through the garage and the barrels fill up with water. They purchased the home in 2014 and has not been aware of anyone in the neighborhood mentioning a trash issue until yesterday. He will be extra cautious to remove it.

Mr. Horn is asked when his pictures were taken. He states that the August 2017 pictures were taken before the walkway was put in.

Alex suggests perhaps landscaping would help. Ms. Wilson is agreeable to that.

Bob Twiss asks Rob Kinlin about a photo dated 2018 taken towards the street which shows two barrels and asks if the wall was built after 2018 and how high the wall is. Mr. Kinlin states that the wall is approximately three (3) feet in the front of the lot to approximately six (6) feet towards the back. They discuss the wall.

Herb suggests that there be a condition that the trash cans be moved. Alex doesn't want to make a condition to that affect because of enforcement issues. Ms. Wilson states that they will take care of it.

Alex makes findings:

The Applicants are seeking to demolish the existing garage and construct a new 18 foot by 30 foot garage as required under Section 240-91 (H) as the lot is legally pre-existing nonconforming as there were no zoning requirements as to lot area or requirements at the time of construction. However, since the replacement garage cannot conform to current side yard setbacks, its demolition and replacement construction requires a Special Permit.

There will be a slight reduction in lot coverage (+/- 40 square feet). The FAR will change from 0.283 to 0.296 but will be less than .30. The building height will be 23.71 feet to the plate, below the 30 feet maximum.

Section 240-91(H)(3) requires a special permit for all demolition and rebuilding projects if the proposed demolition and rebuilding cannot satisfy the criteria under Section 240-91(H)(1) "As of Right", but the following criteria must be met:

- Lot Coverage: 18.1% (20% maximum) – 2,128 square feet (2,352 square feet allowed)
- Floor-Area Ratio: 29.6% (30% maximum) –

Gross Floor Area	3,541.5 square feet
Lot Size	11,949 square feet
- Building Height: 23.71 feet to top of plate (30 feet maximum)

Proposed Special Permit Findings

For all Special Permits, the Board is required to make general findings pursuant to § 240-125(C). The Board should review the evidence presented by the Applicant, staff, and members of the public and, after weighing such evidence, is encouraged to articulate if and how the evidence contributes to each of the required findings.

- **The application falls within a category specifically excepted in the ordinance for a grant of a special permit.** Section 240-91(H)(3) allows for the complete demolition and rebuilding of a nonconforming structure by Special Permit.
- **Site Plan Review is not required for single-family residential dwellings.**
- **After an evaluation of all the evidence presented, the proposal fulfills the spirit and intent of the Zoning Ordinance and would not represent a substantial detriment to the public good or the neighborhood affected.**

Further, Section 240-91(H)(3) requires the Board to find that if the proposed demolition and rebuilding cannot satisfy the criteria established is H(1) As-Of-Right, then the Board may allow the demolition and rebuilding by Special Permit provided the Board finds that:

- **The proposed yard setbacks must be equal to or greater than the yard setbacks of the existing building.** The proposed side yard setback will be slightly more conforming than the existing setback – further away from the abutting lot
- **The proposed lot coverage shall not exceed 20% or the existing lot coverage, whichever is greater.** The proposed lot coverage is 18.1%.
- **The floor area ratio shall not exceed 0.30 or the existing floor area ratio of the structure being demolished, whichever is greater.** The proposed FAR is 29.6%.
- **The building height, in feet, shall not exceed 30 feet to the highest plate and shall contain no more than 2 ½ stories.** The proposed height is 23.71 feet to top of plate (30 feet maximum) and the proposed structure is 1 ½ stories.
- **The proposed new dwelling would not be substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood than the existing dwelling.**

Vote:

All in favor

Motion is made by Alex Rodolakis to grant the relief being sought with the following conditions:

Conditions

1. Special Permit No. 2019-027 is granted to Robert B. and Kate E. Kinlin, Jr for the demolition of an existing garage and construction of a 540 square foot garage at 142 Fifth Avenue, Hyannisport (Hyannis).

2. The site development shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the plan entitled "Permit Plan" prepared for #142 Fifth Avenue, West Hyannis Port, Massachusetts by Stephen Doyle and Associates dated February 26, 2019 and design plans by emeritus.
3. The total lot coverage of all structures on the lot shall not exceed 18.1% and the floor-area ratio shall not exceed 29.6%
4. The proposed redevelopment shall represent full build-out of the lot. Further expansion of the dwelling or construction of additional accessory structures is prohibited without prior approval from the Board.
5. All mechanical equipment associated with the dwelling (air conditioners, electric generators, etc.) shall be screened from neighboring homes and the public right-of-way.
6. The decision shall be recorded at the Barnstable County Registry of Deeds and copies of the recorded decision shall be submitted to the Zoning Board of Appeals Office and the Building Division prior to issuance building permit. The rights authorized by this special permit must be exercised within two years, unless extended.

Alex wants to add the following condition which Arlene Wilson and Rob Kinlin agree to:

7. **That the location of the proposed garage shall be no close than the existing structure.**

Vote:

AYE: Alex Rodolakis, David Hirsch, Herb Bodensiek, Paul Pinard, Robert Twiss

NAY: None

GRANTED WITH CONDITIONS

Alex reads the following into the record:

7:01 PM

Appeal No. 2019-028

Souza

Thomas G. & Sylvie G. Souza have applied for a Special Permit in accordance with Section 240-92.B – Nonconforming Structures Used as Single and Two Family Residences. The applicants are proposing to remove and replace the existing deck which encroaches into the side yard setbacks. The current setback requirement for the district in which it is located is ten (10) feet. The property is located at 181 Fifth Avenue, Hyannis, MA as shown on Assessor's Map 245 as Parcel 107. It is located in the Residence B (RB) Zoning District.

Members assigned tonight: Alex Rodolakis, David Hirsch, Herb Bodensiek, Paul Pinard, Robert Twiss

Owner, Mr. Souza is here representing himself. He explains that the deck is original and needs to be replaced. The plan is to replace on the existing footprint and not to expand it at all. He contacted his neighbor, Staci Evers who is also here tonight and in support. He asks for approval of his proposal.

No questions from the board.

Alex asks if there is anyone from the public who would like to speak.

Staci Evers of 191 Fifth Avenue speaks in favor of the proposal and had also submitted a letter previous to tonight's hearing.

Bob Twiss makes findings:

Special Permit Findings

For all Special Permits, the Board is required to make general findings pursuant to § 240-125(C). The Board should review the evidence presented by the Applicant, staff, and members of the public and, after weighing such evidence, is encouraged to articulate if and how the evidence contributes to each of the required findings.

1. The application falls within a category specifically excepted in the ordinance for a grant of a special permit:

Section 240-92 allows for the expansion or alteration of a preexisting nonconforming structure used as a single-family residence with a Special Permit.

2. After an evaluation of all the evidence presented, the proposal fulfills the spirit and intent of the Zoning Ordinance and would not represent a substantial detriment to the public good or the neighborhood affected. **The abutting neighbor has spoken and has no objection.**

Section 240-92 requires the Board to find:

3. The proposed alteration/expansion of the dwelling will not be substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood than the existing building or structure. **That condition has been met.**

Vote:
All in favor

Motion is made by Robert Twiss to approve the relief being sought with the following conditions:

Conditions

Special Permit No. 2019-028 is granted to Thomas G. and Sylvie G. Souza to remove and replace the nonconforming deck located 8.8 feet from the rear setback at 181 Fifth Avenue, Hyannisport (Hyannis), MA.

Alex wants to maintain the setback and no closer than 8.8 feet from the property line.

1. The proposed alterations will be in substantial conformance with the sketch plan by Contractor Robert Walsh included in the application package. **The nonconforming deck will not be located any closer than 8.8 feet from the rear setback of 181 Fifth Avenue. .**
2. This alteration/construction shall represent full build-out of the lot. No additional increase in building coverage or gross square footage shall be permitted without prior approval of this Board.
3. All mechanical equipment associated with the dwelling (air conditioners, electric generators, etc.) shall be located so as to conform to the required setbacks for the district and screened from neighboring homes and the public right-of-way.
4. This decision shall be recorded at the Barnstable County Registry of Deeds and copies filed with the Zoning Board of Appeals and Building Division. The rights authorized by this special permit must be exercised within two years, unless extended.

Vote:
AYE: Alex Rodolakis, David Hirsch, Herb Bodensiek, Paul Pinard, Robert Twiss
NAY: None

GRANTED WITH CONDITIONS

Alex reads the following into the record:

7:02 PM

Appeal No. 2019-029

ER&C Enterprises, LLC.

ER&C Enterprises, LLC have applied for a Modification of Special Permit 2016-028 in order to update Condition # 2 "Proposed Site Plan Layout" with the new plan with revision dates; and Condition #7 to address an updated Site Plan letter. In the alternative, the Applicant seeks a Special Permit in accordance with Sether than get the approvals, they knocked the walls down and thinks they can amend the origction 240-25 B. 1 seeking a drive-through window for beverages and food items which is a permitted accessory use subject to the issuance of a Special Permit. The property is located at 577 West Main Street, Hyannis, MA as shown on Assessor's Map 269 as Parcel 003. It is located in the Highway Business (HB), Groundwater Protection Overlay and Wellhead Protection Overlay Zoning Districts.

Members assigned tonight: Alex Rodolakis, David Hirsch, Herb Bodensiek, Paul Pinard, Mark Hansen

Representative: David Lawler, Esq. Also with him tonight is Mr. Choubah who is the engineer on the project.

Attorney Lawler explains that the applicant has been before this board previously for a Special Permit which was granted and then extended. The plans evolved and it was approved. The situation came about during construction that an engineer found that the walls were not safe, the structure shifted when the roof was removed and instead of a renovation, a mistake was made and the walls were demolished. Everything is the same that was approved by this board, the only difference is that the walls are new. He believes that the spirit of the bylaw has been maintained and not detrimental to the neighborhood. The zoning has changed since they were here originally and the use relief is no longer required. However, he is requesting that the existing Special Permit be modified only to allow for the demolition that has already happened and everything else in the conditions would still apply.

Board discusses. It is noted that when this was originally before the board, it was contentious. Attorney Lawler thinks that it is within the power of this board to modify the Special Permit except for the tearing down of the walls and that the request is that everything else remains.

Alex has concerns about the drive through and continuing traffic monitoring. Lawler just wants to ask for the modification first. What is before them is whether or not they can modify the Special Permit with everything in place with the exception being torn down.

The board deliberates. Mark Hansen asks if there were concerns about stopping the building process. Attorney Lawler explains that no work order was issued but that he did receive a call from the Building Commissioner. Elizabeth Jenkins states that the Building Commissioner intended to issue a stop work order.

Alex asks for public comment. No one speaks.

Board deliberates.

Marks Hansen makes findings:

Special Permit Findings

For all Special Permits, the Board is required to make general findings pursuant to § 240-125(C). The Board should review the evidence presented by the Applicant, staff, and members of the public and, after weighing such evidence, is encouraged to articulate if and how the evidence contributes to each of the required findings.

1. In Application No. 2019-029, E.R.& C Enterprises LLC has requested a modification of Special Permit No. 2016-028 to allow for the demolition of the building or, in the alternative, a Special Permit in accordance with Section 240-25 B. 1. to allow a drive-through at 577 West Main Street, Hyannis.
2. The proposed use and plan received Site Plan Approval - letter dated May 20, 2019
3. After an evaluation of all the evidence presented, the proposal fulfills the spirit and intent of the Zoning Ordinance and would not represent a substantial detriment to the public good or the neighborhood affected.
4. The proposed use of the property will not substantially adversely affect the public health, safety, welfare, comfort or convenience of the community.
5. The proposed use is consistent with the Local Comprehensive Plan, which designates the area for commercial infill and redevelopment.

Vote:

AYE: David Hirsch, Herb Bodensiek, Paul Pinard, Mark Hansen

NAY: Alex Rodolakis

Mark Hansen makes motion to grant with the following conditions:

Conditions

1. Special Permit No. 2019-029 is granted to E R & C Enterprises, LLC. to allow the modification of Special Permit No. 2016-028 to allow for the demolition of the building or, in the alternative, a Special Permit in accordance with Section 240-25 B. 1. to allow a drive-through at 577 West Main Street, Hyannis as shown on Assessor's Map 269 as Parcel 003.
2. The property shall be improved and maintained in substantial conformance with the plan entitled "Proposed Modifications 577 West Main Street, Hyannis, MA 02601" dated March 20, 2019 with a revision date of March 21, 2019, drawn and stamped by Choubah Engineering Group, P.C.
3. Prior to final permitting with the Building Department, the applicant must obtain a license from the Town Manager granting permission to locate parking spaces within the layout of West Main Street.
4. There shall be no further expansion of the building without prior approval from the Board.
5. All existing landscaping and landscape screening shall be maintained on the site.
6. There shall be no outdoor storage, including storage in temporary trailers or containers, trucks or storage units, on the site.
7. All dumpsters or trash disposal containers shall be located within the designated trash enclosure.
8. This decision shall be recorded at the Barnstable County Registry of Deeds and copies of the recorded decision shall be submitted to the Zoning Board of Appeals Office and the Building Division for this special permit to be in effect. The rights authorized by this special permit must be exercised within two years, unless extended by the Board.

Alex suggests that in Condition #1 to delete "or in the alternative" to allow for the demolition of the building at" and jump to 577 West Main Street, etc.. Jenkins suggests that they do the suggested conditions submitted to the board members tonight that reflect the conditions with the prior special permit. Attorney Lawler has no objection.

And then to adopt the original conditions from Special Permit 2016-028, Conditions #1 through 16.

Vote:

AYE: David Hirsch, Herb Bodensiek, Paul Pinard, Mark Hansen

NAY: Alex Rodolakis

GRANTED WITH CONDITONS

Correspondence

Received 05-10-19 from Cape Cod Commission – Development of Regional Impact Decision approval for the Vineyard Wind Connector project.

Matters Not Reasonably Anticipated by the Chair

Upcoming Meetings

June 12, 2019, June 26, 2019, July 10, 2019, July 24, 2019

ALEX WILL NOT BE HERE ON June 12th.

Adjournment

Motion is made by Mark Hansen and seconded by Paul Pinard to adjourn

Vote:

All in favor

Approved