



**TOWN OF BARNSTABLE
TOWN COUNCIL WORKSHOP
SOLID WASTE DISPOSAL
July 24, 2014**



A quorum being duly present, Council President Jessica Rapp Grasseti called the July 24, 2014, Town Council Workshop to order at 6:07 p.m. in the Hearing Room of Town Hall, 367 Main St., Hyannis, MA.

Roll Call done by Administrative Assistant Cynthia A. Lovell

PRESENT: Town Council President, Jessica Rapp Grasseti, Vice President of Town Council Ann Canedy, Frederick Chirigotis, Jennifer Cullum, Philip Wallace, Eric R. Steinhilber, John Norman, Paul Hebert, James Crocker Jr., William Crocker Jr., Sara Cushing, **ARRIVED**

LATE: Fred Chirigotis, **ABSENT:** James Tinsley, Jr, Debra S. Dagwan

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by President Jessica Rapp Grasseti.

President Rapp Grasseti introduced Director of the Department of Public Works, Daniel Santos.

Solid Waste Disposal Workshop

Daniel Santos started the PowerPoint presentation giving a brief explanation on the information contained in the PowerPoint.

Current operations:

- New disposal contract
- Master planning effort
- Pay as you throw / curbside collection
- East side recycling facility

The benefits of the current operation in Marstons Mills:

- Open 7 days per week
- Household trash
- Recyclables – Free to all residents with or without a sticker
- Reusables
- Yard waste
- Hazardous (4 days per year)

Explanation regarding the current on-going negotiations with New Bedford Waste Services

- Commencement Date: January 1, 2015
- Recommended Vendor: New Bedford Waste Services
- Base Term: 10 years
- Term Extensions: 2 @ 5 years
- Tipping Fee: \$55.00/ton
- Transportation costs: \$12.00/ton
- Net Cost per ton: \$67.00

Contract Terms:

- Transportation Mode: Truck to Rochester
- No maximum or minimum tonnage
- Waste Disposition: Processed into fuel briquettes
- Recyclables: Free transportation, no reimbursement
- Escalation: 2.5% per year (commencing 1/1/17)

Cost Saving Benefits:

- Significant cost savings (\$1.5 million over 10 years)
- Environmentally friendly disposal method
- The town will no longer have to transport MSW to Yarmouth
- All of the Town's waste disposal needs handled by one entity
- Experienced company with more than 40 years experience
- Positive references
- Strong desire to work with the Town

Mr. Santos continued discussion with the idea that has been mentioned a couple of times regarding the option of an **East side facility** and described the process and things to consider if this option was looked at;

- Operations
 - Full or partial week service
 - Personnel Requirements
 - Equipment
 - Indoors vs. outdoors if in Hyannis
 - Single vs. multi-stream
- Permitting
- Site Selection
- Traffic Issues
- Vector Issues
 - Indoors vs. Outdoors
- Site Security Issues
 - Indoors vs. Outdoors
 - Fencing
- NIMBY
- Financing

Mr. Santos clarified that the Transfer station does not make any money in recycling items, so that would have to be considered when it comes to financing a facility.

Mr. Santos concluded his presentation asking what the goals were for the Town and what is needed to obtain those goals, and decide on policies, what he is looking for and the Town Manager is direction from the Council on setting those goals.

President Rapp Grassetti congratulated ABC (New Bedford Waste) for the negotiations with the town on a contract. President Grassetti had heard that the facility would not be open until October, but did ask if there were other facilities that ABC would truck to until the facility was up and running. Mr. Balboni stated there are other facilities we can haul to right now until we are up and running at no cost to your town.

Councilor Cullum said at this point all the solid waste is being done by rail and now it is going to be done all by truck? When is this all going to start?

Mr. Santos stated that it would be varied and based on when the containers are full so as needed or required.

Councilor Cullum asked what it has cost us to truck our waste to Yarmouth.

Mr. Santos replied \$60,000 (sixty thousand).

Councilor Norman asked Mr. Santos if the system as it is now at the landfill in Marstons Mills going to stay the same.

Mr. Santos stated everything for now will remain the same unless we redesign the landfill, but as it stands right now contracting with ABC will remain the same.

President Grassetti asked what happens to our recycles now.

Mr. Santos stated we receive nothing for recycles, the benefit right now is all of our recyclables are hauled away for free, the town residents if they choose to recycle pays nothing to bring it to our transfer station and we pay nothing for it to be hauled away right now.

President Grassetti asked if we did single stream at the transfer station would it save us any money?

Mr. Santos said that is in our vision for the landfill to redesign the ways people drop off their trash, but I caution in a total redesign, people get very used to the way it is now and when you change things it disrupts people and not many people adapt to change, so we are mindful of that.

President Grassetti also wanted to point out that if a resident of Barnstable does not want to buy a sticker, you can as a household bring up to 8 bags of trash and pay a flat rate of \$15.00 (fifteen) dollars is that correct? So you do not need to be a resident in order to get rid of your trash.

Mr. Santos stated yes, there are people that are here for a short time that can use the Solid Waste Facility to get rid of their trash up to 8 bags for that fee.

Councilor Norman asked you mentioned a facility in Sandwich, wasn't there a fire there?

Mr. Balboni said yes we are looking at in about a month or two to be reopened,

Councilor Norman asked where they are taking things now if this Sandwich location is not open.

Mr. Balboni stated they are utilizing the Rochester site, and if something happened to Rochester then we will go to New Bedford at no cost to Barnstable.

Councilor Norman asked if we ever looked at a contract with Bourne.

Mr. Santos said they had preliminary discussions with them, but then realized they needed to go with a company that could have a capacity to handle Barnstable and also look at long term goals.

President Grassetti asked if their facility would take food compost.

Mr. Balboni said they are planning to get a digester, right now the best waste that comes into our facility is dry waste. So the facilities that take these types of waste are very limited because they are using the digester for waste water.

Councilor Canedy asked if they could discuss the pros and cons of burning trash vs. burying the trash.

Mr. Balboni said really there are three ways to get rid of trash, (1) burning, (2) burying, (3) recycling; ABC is going to recycle 90 to 95 percent of materials coming in. He stated that if you bury the waste it is the worst method (no recovery, methane gas, landfill becomes worse, when you burn everything there is nothing left to recycle its all gone, but recycling allows us to recover and make use of recyclable materials such as the briquettes. Mr. Balboni said at his center we have bag breakers (these are people that break open the bags of trash, and remove all the recyclables and recycle them, the rest gets burned and briquettes are created from the burned materials.

Councilor Hebert asked if it would affect our local haulers.

Mr. Balboni said it will not affect them at all because they will continue to pick up and bring to the transfer station for us to pick up.

Councilor Hebert asked how the glass is handled.

Mr. Balboni said there is only one facility that takes glass and that is Strategic Recycling, glass is the hardest to recycle, but ABC will take the glass and bring it to Strategic Recycling.

Councilor William Crocker asked if we went to PAYT program how would that effect our current operations at the transfer station?

Mr. Santos said our transfer station would remain the same we may have some of the employees shifting more to recyclables, but the overall operation would remain the same.

Councilor William Crocker asked ABC if they had customers for the briquettes that are created after a burn.

Mr. Balboni stated yes they do two that have committed as soon as our facility is open, there are some colleges and universities that burn coal for heating in the winter in the North, and they have asked us if they can get these from us.

President Rapp Grassetti asked the Chair of Renewable Energy to present the next presentation.

Alison Alessi thanked the Council for inviting them to the workshop.

In 2010 the Council asked us as a committee to look at other ways of getting rid of the trash and coming up with ideas on recycling.

Review and analyze solid waste program options
Including town wide recycling because the trash
Disposal tipping fees to increase significantly after
2014

- Empower residents to control/limit trash disposal costs
- State "Waste Ban"
- Environmental benefits of recycling

Barnstable is currently only 16% in recycling.

- 1992-93

DPW Curbside Review Recommended Contracted town-wide curbside program / Participation optional

3 town sectors

- 2002-03

PAYT Pilot Program

Survey of 200 participants

Participants highly favorable towards PAYT

Participants said they recycled more, disposed less, and paid less

Recommended expanding PAYT to all transfer station users

1. Implement contracted PAYT curbside trash and recycling collection with three "sectors divided by population density.

- Keep transfer station open for Bulky items, C&D, yard waste, and for residents who can't/won't access the curbside program.
- Establish new Board of Health regulations requiring private haulers to offer bundled pricing for trash and recycling collection accompanied by enhanced reporting requirements.

2. Implement PAYT for current transfer station users

- Establish new Board of Health regulations requiring private haulers to offer bundled pricing for trash and recycling collection accompanied by enhanced reporting requirements.

PAYT – How it Works

- Also called Unit-based pricing/ SMART
- Residents pay for what they throw away
- Recycling is Free
- Various models
 - Bags (purchased from stores throughout town - 33 gal., 15 gal., 8 gal.)
 - Stickers
 - Vendor or Town-managed system
- Fixed costs paid for by annual flat sticker fee
- Disposal costs paid for by bag fees

Why Pay As You Throw (PAYT)?

- Single most effective and equitable program for reducing waste and increasing recycling
- Like a utility: users pay for amount of waste disposed; free unlimited recycling
- Proven track record - 141 communities in MA. Curbside and drop-off; Sandwich, Wellfleet, Brewster, and Plymouth
- Trash tonnage decreases: average: 40-50%
- Recycling tonnage increases 15-40%

Town of Sandwich Results

- PAYT started at transfer station July 1, 2011
- 42% trash reduction for first year
- Commingling (cans, bottles, plastics) – Up 74%
- Fiber (paper, cardboard) – Up 20%
- Recycling rate – 54% (29% prior to PAYT)
- Traffic volume at TS – Down 19%
- \$120,000 savings/year @ \$58 P/Ton T&D
- Town adopted hauler regulations mandating bundled pricing (trash and recycling combined)

Financial Benefits:

Reducing Trash/Increased Recycling

- Transfer Station – Avoided Disposal Costs
- Present SW T&D costs: \$44.70 p/ton
- FY 2008-13 average 8,999 t/MSW x 44% = 3,960 tons/PAYT reduction
- 3,960 tons x \$44.70 = **\$177,012 PAYT cost savings**
- Projected SW T&D costs: \$67.00 p/ton
- 3,960 tons x \$67.00 = **\$265,320 cost savings w/PAYT (\$3,979,800 over 15 - year ZWS Disposal Contract term)**

Town-wide Curbside PAYT for SW and Recycling

PROS

- Equity and Fairness
- Cost reductions on tipping fees because less solid waste tonnage
- Increased recycling
- Fewer private vehicle trips to TS – saves energy and fuel costs
- Less duplication of effort by trash hauler trucks – few trucks less often
- Ease of transition: Substantial majority of households already use private trash haulers in a curbside program
- Less illegal dumping in conservation lands and along roadsides
- Allows town to access Mass DEP grants and funding – up to \$150,000

CONS

- More barrels/bags on side of road
- Some residents who presently use transfer station may be opposed
- Smaller vendors could be disadvantaged by RFP

PAYT for Existing Transfer Station Users

Pros

- Equity and Fairness
- Residents can control their solid waste disposal costs
- Increased recycling
- Cost savings for residents
- Minimal changes from current system
- PAYT has proven record – 141 PAYT communities in MA
- Allows town to access Mass DEP grants and funding (up to \$10p/household)

Cons

- Residents are used to paying one fee for waste disposal
- PAYT requires setting up a system to sell bags or stickers to residents
- Concern some residents may switch to private haulers
- Continues inefficiencies of a third of residents driving to TS

Additional actions to increase recycling

- Create additional recycling drop - off center on east side of town
- Reconfigure transfer station to put recycling drop off first
- Offer dual or single stream recycling
- Improve and increase recycling signage at Transfer Station
- Do more recycling education and outreach
- Enhance waste ban enforcement at Transfer Station
- Full curbside pickup with PAYT maximizes recycling and other environmental benefits, and provides the greatest long term cost savings for the town's residents
- PAYT offers most equitable SW disposal system based on usage
- PAYT is most effective strategy to reduce SW

President Rapp Grassetti invited Tom McKean, Director of Board of Health

Mr. Elrick commented on the presentation and wanted to let the Council know that Dan Quinn was here, he is the Barnstable County Regional Coordinator of Recycling, who has worked

with all the Cape towns with their development with the PAYT program, and he also wanted to introduce President Waste Zero who is the company that handles the vendor responsibilities with the many cities and towns that have the PAYT program, Mark Dancy and Sandra Perez representative of Waste Zero.

President Rapp Grasseti asked about the recommendation that was in 1992-1993, was that recommendation that came from the Department of Public Works, and could you tell us what happened to that recommendation.

Mr. Elrick said that much of the decisions and policy making is either made or broken at the leadership of the Town Council of that time, we had an election in 1993 and most of the supporters of that time either choose not to run or were not on the Council the following year, so it never got up and running, and there was a number of opposition from the local haulers, Mr. Elrick deferred to Assistant Town Manager Mark Ells who at the time was the Director of the Department of public works.

Assistant Town Manager Mark Ells explained that at that time we went through a very similar discussion there were issues relative to extending the contract and we were looking for a chance to recycle more, Mr. Elrick framed it accurately in that the technical merits were there to consider curb side collection there were major funding issues there was a lack of understanding to a certain degree in being able to charge a fee for curbside pick up vs. having it part of the general tax base, there was a significant difference in opinion so we never got through that discussion, with that and the Town Council's concerns regarding the private haulers and the smaller businesses in the community would never survive if given that scenario, so it never moved from that point and it was ultimately turned down.

Councilor Canedy and Councilor Cushing went to an excellent seminar that was put on by a consultant that was hired by the Cape Cod Commission, and it was her understanding that that consultant would be available at no cost to anyone that wanted to talk to him.

Mr. Elrick said yes that is true, they offered to attend any workshop and give any background on PAYT and talk to the Council.

Councilor Canedy suggested that the Council decide which direction we need to move in and achieve our end goal, and decide what our end goal is. Councilor Canedy would like to have an in-depth workshop on just the information of curbside and transfer station options, can they work together in conjunction with or are they exclusive, would the town save money, your presentation was excellent, however some of the facts that you mentioned I would like the Council to delve into them so we can understand those facts, so in the end I would like ask the Council consider inviting that consultant to a workshop going forward.

President Rapp Grasseti had a question regarding the recycle rate, and was stated in your presentation that we have a very low recycle rate, do we even know what our recycle rate is if we can't obtain that information from the haulers. What do you propose to cure that, is it a reform in the hauler regulations, bundle pricing, or is there another option?

Alison Alessi Chair of the Renewable Energy Commission has invited the private haulers to a number of their meetings and those that came told the Committee that they recycle at about 10% (ten percent) but that is just in conversation. She also felt that bundle pricing would bring recycling to 100%,

President Rapp Grasseti asked that if bundle pricing is instituted wouldn't that mean households recycle less because you can throw everything into one bag for one price.

Mr. Elrick discussed other places that have instituted bundle pricing have it tends to serve as an incentive to recycle more, but one of the key items to be looked at is you need real data, and we do not know what that real data is because the private haulers do not share that information. The Commission had asked for the haulers to do enhanced reporting, but if you do nothing else, as part of the licensure of these haulers with the Board of Health, is to ask what percentage of customers they have are recycling.

Mr. McKean, Director, Board of Health said that he and Mr. Elrick had a conversation about this, and as part of the licensing would be that question asked. President Rapp Grassetti then asked if it would be a requirement of renewing their license. Mr. McKean said right now it is not a requirement, just a question we could ask them, however he will ask the Board of Health Committee to make it a requirement in the near future, however his only concern would be to far beyond this in monitoring , our department right now could not monitor all the trash of recycling.

Councilor Chirigotis said these recycling rate numbers will be obscured for the following reasons of gathering the data, it is proprietary, it does not include those households that have private haulers and also use the transfer station, so the data will never be accurate, but you may be able to get a better handle on it with reporting.

Councilor Cushing asked how Sandwich handles this all this, did their haulers report to them, did they have solid data, and if they did how was it obtained.

Mr. Elrick said in speaking with Mr. Tilton of Sandwich, it has been a challenge, they passed the bundle requirement, and it has been a challenge and are seeing resistance from the haulers, from what he said they are going to put more enfases on regulating it, and the Board of Health in Sandwich is reaching out to the private haulers and asking questions.

Councilor Cullum has a hard time for with the data chart, it is very inaccurate data, and as a small business owner in the past, the haulers were the ones being punished because their customer was not recycling, so I have a hard time applying this to everyone.

Councilor James Crocker said he had a hard time with the math.

Mark Dancy, President of Waste Zero Management spoke regarding the tonnage of waste. We have been doing PAYT programs for over 20 years, we run 800 Municipal Recycling programs with bags or some are with tag systems in 42 different states. This Council has asked the same question everyone else has asked and that is for every pound that is diverted or reduced approximately 40% of that reduction goes into municipal waste stream, there are other types of recycling, textiles is approximately 7% of the municipal waste stream, 70 to 80 percent of textiles are thrown away.

Councilor Crocker stated that these numbers change with the demographics of certain areas and where is that adjustment in the presentation done by Renewable Energy, when this happens.

Councilor Canedy said this council needs concrete numbers on how much this will cost the residents, we need scenarios, and we are a summer community as well, so what are our next steps in this process? How will our Transfer Station be affected on what process is chosen. Do we also need another workshop to look at this information given to us?

Councilor Cullum stated based on the information given to us tonight she could not make a decision, she could on the 1/3 that uses the transfer station, it would be PAYT and move on, but that decision can't be based on the entire town and only 1/3 of its users, my decision needs to be what benefits the whole town.

President Rapp Grassetti introduced Bob Ciolek, Vice Chair of the CFAC Committee who presented an update. CFAC was approached by the President of the Town Council in June to update its 2012 report, but only as it relates to the cost impact of the proposed new contract. The Department of Public Works budget related to the new contract in their opinion is quite good, it may fluctuate a little with the tonnage, but the FY15 budget is conservative and is in the Committees discussions are the best they can be.

Councilor Cushing agreed that all of the information presented tonight was very helpful and useful, however if we as a council do not know what our goal is then how can we take this information presented several times in workshops, and ultimately decide on what is best for the town. We need to set our goal, and then decide on which program would be best.

Councilor Norman echoed other Councilors comments, we do not need another workshop, we have enough information to set a goal and work towards that. Councilor Norman said that our current Transfer Station allows you to drop up to 8 bags of trash for \$15 (fifteen) and you can recycle for free, he is not hearing from his constituents that they want to change the way it is right now, if you want to use the Transfer Station and recycle for free then do so, if you do not want to pay the resident sticker price and you recycle, then do not buy the sticker and recycle for free, this will reduce you solid waste bag amount. Councilor Norman said he did not want to force any household to do one or the other; it should be a choice for our residents.

President Grassetti thanked everyone who came and presented the information to us.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon motion duly made and seconded it was

VOTED: To adjourn

ADJOURNED: AT 8:30pm

Respectfully submitted,
Cynthia A. Lovell
Administrative Assistant
Town Council