

MINUTES

Barnstable Historical Commission

This meeting was held by remote participation via Zoom Meetings

February 21, 2023 at 3:00 PM

Fran Parks, Chair	Present
Nancy Shoemaker, Vice Chair	Present
Marilyn Fifield, Clerk	Present
George Jessop	Present; late arrival.
Cheryl Powell	Present
Nancy Clark	Present
Jack Kay	Present
Barbara DeBiase, Alternate	Present
Jessica Rapp Grasseti, Town Council Liaison	Absent
Kate Maldonado, Planning & Development Staff, Assistant Director	Present
Erica Brown, Administrative Assistant	Present

Chair Fran Parks called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm

Acting under the provisions of the Code of the Town of Barnstable, ss 112-1 through 112-7, the Historical Commission held a Public Hearing on the following applications previously determined significant and referred to Public Hearing:

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

None

Applications

Brown, Emily & Winsor, Lisa- 651 Main Street, Cotuit, Map 036, Parcel 017, Built 1860, Inventoried

Partial Demolition: Construct full dormer on right side of home.

Homeowner Emily Brown explained that they would like to construct a dormer on the right side of the home to expand closet space and living space, and she said the dormer would not be visible from the corner at all because of the woods on that side of the home on the corner of Lowell and Main Street.

Discussion: Nancy Clark felt the proposed dormer window looked unbalanced from the exterior, but Ms Brown replied that that is where the closet will be going, reminding that the dormer will not be visible from the side, and only the front will be seen. Nancy Clark suggested a window with heavy curtains to help the unbalanced look.

Public Comment: None

Approved 3/21/2023

Motion 1:

Cheryl moved that after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 651 Main Street, Cotuit, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Nancy S. seconded the motion.

So Voted:

Aye-

Nay- Nancy S., Marilyn, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran

Abstain-

Motion 2:

Cheryl moved that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 651 Main Street, Cotuit, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

Nancy S. seconded the motion.

So Voted:

Aye- Jack, Nancy C., Cheryl, George, Marilyn, Nancy S., Fran

Nay-

Abstain-

Saul, Francis & Patricia – 355 Eel River Road, Osterville, Map 114 Parcel 023. Built c. 1930

Partial Demolition: Construct an exterior elevator shaft on the left elevation of the existing house.

Representing the applicants, Gordon Clark explained that the elevator shaft will be added to the addition to the house which was built in 2006, adding that the homeowners would like the elevator access for mobility and accessibility.

Discussion: Gordon clarified that it is electric/hydraulic with a railway on the side and no cables. Nancy Clark asked if the entrance to the elevator is an existing door, and Gordon replied yes, but it is only accessible from the interior, also noting that there is no ramp and that the grade of the ground/house is nearly level. He said there would be no modifications to the interior of the house because there is no necessity to do that. George asked if ventilation is required at the top of the shaft, and Gordon answered that no ventilation is necessary, as it is a piston elevator and doesn't require it. Gordon reminded that the elevator is in the back of the house and the shingle pattern will match what exists, with false windows to make it look like part of the house. He added that it is hard to hide an elevator, but he hoped that the false windows and siding will hide it and tie in with the house. Cheryl complimented him on doing a very good job with the plans.

Public Comment: None

Motion 1:

Cheryl moved that after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 355 Eel River Road, Osterville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Nancy S. seconded the motion.

So Voted:

Aye-

Nay - Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran

Abstain-

Motion 2:

Cheryl moved that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 355 Eel River Road, Osterville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

Nancy C. seconded the motion.

So Voted:

Aye- Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran

Nay-

Abstain-

Eagan, Christopher & Mary Ellen - 676 Scudder Avenue, Hyannis, Map 287, Parcel 008, Built 1880, Inventoried

Partial Demolition: Front porch and side porch to be rebuilt, house to be raised for construction of new foundation, windows to be moved/relocated, larger dormer added to south elevation, and small dormer added to north elevation.

Gordon Clark represented homeowner Mary Ellen Eagan, who was also present.

Gordon said they plan to keep the existing aluminum siding, with everything to be rebuilt the same once the foundation is done and with windows to be relocated close to where the existing windows are. He said they would like to keep the existing staircase in the house, adding the ramp as shown on the drawings, with the rest of the house remaining as it is now.

Discussion: George suggested substituting closed shutters for the staircase window to keep the symmetry, with a double-hung window over the kitchen to keep the façade intact. Gordon clarified that the porch will be rebuilt but the proportions will remain the same, and Mary Ellen clarified that she would like the ramp to remain for accessibility.

Public Comment: None

Motion 1:

Cheryl moved that after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 676 Scudder Avenue, Hyannis, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Nancy C. seconded the motion.

Roll Call Vote:

Aye-

Nay- Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran

Abstain-

Motion 2:

Cheryl moved that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 676 Scudder Avenue, Hyannis, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

Approved 3/21/2023

George seconded the motion.

*Aye- Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran
Nay-
Abstain-*

Crory, Robert & Lauren- 117 Lake Elizabeth Drive, Centerville, Map 226, Parcel 053, Built 1890, Inventoried

Partial Demolition: Enclose 14' x 6' covered porch.

Representative Bill O'Brien said the home was built in 1890 and renovated in 2014. He said the applicants would like to keep the same door and windows, trim and shingles to match the same trim design as the front of the house with two windows added to the left elevation of the home.

Discussion: George asked about shelter over the front entry door, since it does not have a stoop and does not need a threshold. He felt the casing should match the line and the width to carry the line down. Bill replied that he could do that, but he would prefer to keep the plans as submitted. George said that it was a suggestion to keep the symmetry.

Public Comment: None

Motion 1:

Cheryl moved that after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 117 Lake Elizabeth Drive, Centerville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building. Nancy C. seconded the motion.

*Aye-
Nay- Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran
Abstain-*

Motion 2:

Cheryl moved that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 117 Lake Elizabeth Drive, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

George seconded the motion.

*Aye- Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran
Nay-
Abstain-*

Kinder, James & Herlihy, Julie- 85 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, Map 287, Parcel 075, Built 1875

Partial Demolition: Remove NE addition roof and rebuild with second-story dormer with gable to match, rebuild NE gable end chimney, remove SW 1-story shed roof and rebuild with second-story gable and dormer to match, with windows, doors, trim, siding, decking to be replaced.

Representing the applicants, Craig Ashworth referred to the drawings, noting that they would like to add a new second-story gable that embraces the chimney.

Approved 3/21/2023

Discussion: George asked if the roof will lap as the existing roof does, and Craig confirmed that it will remain the same. Commissioners appreciated the presentation.

Public Comment: None

Motion 1:

Cheryl moved that after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 85 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building. Nancy C. seconded the motion.

Aye-

Nay- Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Jack, Nancy C., Fran

Abstain-

Motion 2:

Cheryl moved that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 85 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town. Nancy S. seconded the motion.

Aye- Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Jack, Nancy C., Fran

Nay-

Abstain-

Other:

Award Preservation Guidelines: Updated and Revised

Fran asked if everyone had reviewed the items. Nancy C. referred to page 2, suggesting that no self-nominations be accepted. Cheryl agreed with Nancy C., and Nancy C. then questioned if the Town Council should make the last decision from Historical Commission recommendations. George and Nancy S. agreed that it is not a Town award but the Historical Commission's award. Cheryl pointed out the Town Council does do this for other commissions, noting that this deliberation has taken a long time before a decision was made.

Nancy C. moved to change the next-to-last paragraph to state that there is no limit on the awards and anyone may apply, with any number of nominations - or none - to be considered annually, with presentation to be made by the Town Council. Nancy S. seconded the motion.

Aye: Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran

Nancy S. moved to amend the last bullet to read that the names of the individuals and organizations that the BHC accepts as nominees for Preservation Awards would be sent to the Town Council with the request to announce and present the awards at a Town Council Meeting.

Nancy Clark seconded the motion.

Aye: Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran,

Nancy C. moved to remove the phrase "as was the original intention at the inception of these rewards" and replace the sentence with "Anyone may apply with the exclusion of self-nominations."

George seconded the motion.

Aye: Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Cheryl, Nancy C., Jack, Fran

Fran moved to include where to find the resource of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, also deleting from the name "for the Rehabilitation of."

Nancy C. seconded the motion.

Aye: Jack, Nancy C., Cheryl, George, Nancy S., Fran

Abstain: Marilyn

Barbara suggested that the whole document be editorially cleaned up.

A discussion ensued about the last paragraph referring to recusals. Fran felt that the entire paragraph should be removed. George stated that it had already been covered under standards of procedure. Cheryl referred to the State Ethics Commission determination that no one can be told to recuse, saying that she preferred this to be stated.

Fran moved to remove the last paragraph referring to recusals.

Nancy C. seconded the motion.

Aye: Jack, Nancy C., Cheryl, George, Marilyn, Nancy S., Fran

Commissioners agreed that the document should come back for approval after these revisions.

Cheryl Powell excused herself from the meeting as she had another obligation.

Community Preservation Committee Update: Marilyn Fifield reported that the Committee approved the Unitarian Church restoration application.

Discussion of upcoming historical events open to the public: Nancy S. noted the loss of two very important people in the community who have had a significant historical impact: John Reed and James Otis Ellis.

Approval of Minutes:

Nancy C. moved to approve the Minutes from December 20, 2022, and January 17, 2023.

Marilyn seconded the motion.

Aye- Nancy S., Marilyn, George, Nancy C., Jack, Fran

Next meeting will be March 21st, 2023

With no further business before this Commission, a motion was duly made by Commissioner Nancy S. and seconded by Commissioner Clark to adjourn the meeting.

Aye: Nancy S., Nancy C., George, Jack, Marilyn, Fran

Meeting adjourned at 4:47 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,

Erica Brown, Administrative Assistant

and edited by Commission Clerk Marilyn Fifield

Approved 3/21/2023