APPROVED MINUTES

Barnstable Historical Commission Barnstable Town Hall, 367 Main Street, Hyannis Selectmen's Conference Room

BARNSTABLE TOWN CLERK 2018 APR 19 PM 1:23

March 20, 2018

Laurie Young, Chair	Absent
Nancy Clark, Vice Chair	Present
Marilyn Fifield, Clerk	Present
Nancy Shoemaker	Absent
George Jessop	Present
Elizabeth Mumford	Present
Cheryl Powell	Present
Jessica Rapp Grassetti, Town Council Liaison	Present

Vice Chair, Nancy Clark called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm

Acting under the provisions of the Code of the Town of Barnstable, ss 112-1 through 112-7, the Historical Commission held a Public Hearing on the following applications previously determined significant and referred to Public Hearing:

APPLICATIONS

Continued Application: Sprinkle, Brad, 3600 Falmouth Road, Marstons Mills, Map 077, Parcel 005, Charles Marston Homestead, Built c.1821, Inventoried, Full demolition of two structures (Exhibit A)

<u>Represented by:</u> Brad Sprinkle Public comment: Bob Frazee

This application was continued to allow Commissioners to inspect and photograph the structures as noted on the application, and Vice Chair Nancy Clark shared the photographs that George Jessop and Nancy Shoemaker provided from their visit at the property.

George Jessop said that the structure was constructed as an open-stud building with no heating and has been modified with a floor furnace and provision for a stove on the second floor. He called the structure moderately sound, but felt some rebuilding was needed. He said the interior is all plywood paneling which covers horsehair plaster, and he did not know the condition of the exterior because it is covered by vinyl siding. He said the second floor plaster is separating from the lath, and he thought its original windows on the first floor indicated that it dates from the post-Civil-War/early Victorian era. He identified its best feature as the handrail to the second floor, saying the dormers are a later addition. He called the windows on the first floor original and all 2 over 2, with 1 over 1 on the second.

Bob Frazee, asked if much of the original structure remains, and Mr. Jessop repeated that he felt that the windows indicate the structure is post-Civil-War, closer to 1875 or thereabout, but newer than the 1821 date of the Inventory Form B.

Mr. Frazee asked Mr. Jessop if he felt comfortable assessing if the structure could be moved, and Mr. Jessop replied that it is possible to move anything.

Elizabeth Mumford asked Mr. Sprinkle what year the house was last inhabited, and he replied that the house was last occupied around 2000, adding that he purchased the property in 2006.

Nancy Clark read an email provided by Nancy Shoemaker to share her opinion that the house is in an irreversible state of decay.

Ms. Mumford expressed concern that there isn't more time, saying that she could not support demolition at this point.

Vice Chair Clark asked Mr. Jessop if there was any evidence of an older, larger chimney, and he replied that the evidence of the kitchen stove in the back can be seen.

Based on the photos provided, Ms. Clark felt that the chimney in the kitchen appeared to be a newer brick.

Mr. Jessop said there was no evidence of a large chimney, with only one chimney visible and one fully enclosed in the wall.

Ms. Mumford asked Mr. Sprinkle if salvageable materials would be recovered if the home is demolished, and he assured her that he would reclaim any materials possible.

Ms. Clark asked Mr. Sprinkle if he had been under the house, and he replied not since 2006, noting a lot of sagging underneath.

Mr. Jessop pointed out the angle of the doorway in the first photograph that does not match any other angle, and the sag of the ceiling, saying the angle indicates there is some kind of shift.

Marilyn Fifield said she'd hoped for an independent, professional evaluation of the home before the Commission vote on demolition.

MOTION 1:

Cheryl Powell moved, seconded by George Jessop, that, after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 3600 Falmouth Road, Marstons Mills, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote:

AYE: 1-Fifield

NAY: 3

ABSTAIN: 1 - Clark

VOTE: 3 Nay, 1 Aye, 1 Abstain

IF MOTION 1 FAILS (NAY VOTE):

Cheryl Powell moved, seconded by George Jessop, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the full demolition of the building located at 3600 Falmouth Road, Marstons Mills, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

An AYE vote determines that the full demolition IS NOT detrimental – no demolition delay imposed.

AYE: 3 NAY: 2 (Clark and Fifield) ABSTAIN: 0 VOTE: 3:2

Thomas, Lance, 1248 Craigville Beach Road, Centerville, Map 206, Parcel 082 Full demolition of garage & shed (Exhibit B)

Represented by: Anne Michniewicz

Public comment: None

Ms. Michniewicz outlined plans to tear down the garage, a shed attached to the side, and a bunk house, as she said they would require excessive repair. She said a two-car garage would then be constructed.

Vice Chair Clark asked the applicant to amend the application to include the bunkhouse in the demolition plans.

George Jessop asked about the location of the house in the floodplain, and Ms. Michniewicz said that Conservation and the Zoning Board approval would still be required before proceeding.

Cheryl Powell reported that she visited the property and she agreed with the applicant's description of the condition of the garage/shed.

Marilyn Fifield sought confirmation that there is no Inventory form for this property, and Mr. Jessop said he did not feel this is an antique structure.

In reply to a question, Jessica Rapp-Grasetti reminded that all abutters are notified as part of the demolition application process.

MOTION 1:

Elizabeth Mumford moved, seconded George Jessop, that after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 1248 Craigville Beach Road, Centerville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

VOTE: Aye, Unanimous

MOTION II:

Elizabeth Mumford moved, seconded by George Jessop, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 1248 Craigville Beach Road, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

An AYE vote determines that the partial demolition IS NOT detrimental - no demolition delay imposed.

VOTE: Aye, unanimous

Edward M. Kennedy Institute for the United States Senate, 50 Marchant Avenue, Hyannis Port, Ambassador Joseph P. Kennedy House, built c.1904, Individually Listed, National Register of Historic Places, as well as a National Historic Landmark

Partial Demolition – Remove and replace deck boards, damaged framing work, ceiling boards, and damaged ceiling framing in work area; install deck drain system (Exhibit C)

<u>Represented by:</u> Nathan Boutin, Structural Engineer; Patrick Guthrie, Design Associates; Eileen Driscoll, Kathleen Grant. <u>Public comment:</u> None

Mr. Boutin explained that there have been many repairs to the deck, but there is also a drainage problem, and he confirmed that there is a crawl space below the decking.

Mr. Guthrie described the project, noting that the changes are structural and there will be no change in exterior aesthetics, with everything to remain as it exists.

Vice Chair Clark confirmed that the deck boards will be replaced in kind, pre-primed and following the existing staggered pattern, then painted, with no change to windows or doors.

Marilyn Fifield asked the applicants if they have conferred with the National Park Service, adding that it could be a good idea even if the planned work is assumed to be acceptable.

Ms. Driscoll replied that she met with Sarah Korjeff of the Cape Cod Commission who felt that the project was administrative.

MOTION 1: Referral to the Cape Cod Commission¹

George Jessop moved, seconded by Cheryl Powell, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds and determines that, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 50 Marchant Avenue, Hyannis Port, that:

- The property is outside a local historic district;
- The property is a National Historic Landmark and listed in the National Register of Historic Places
- The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's National Register status as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;

The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

VOTE: Nay, Unanimous

MOTION 2: Partial Demolition of Building

George Jessop moved, seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds, after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and record file for the partial demolition proposed at 50 Marchant Avenue, Hyannis Port, that this Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

VOTE: Nay, Unanimous

IF MOTION 1 FAILS (NAY VOTE):

George Jessop moved, seconded by Cheryl Powell, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 50 Marchant Avenue, Hyannis Port, <u>is not</u> detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

VOTE: Aye, Unanimous

Other

Discussion - creation of Preservation Award

Vice Chair Clark recalled that previous preservation awards recognized exceptional projects, and she read questions and comments provided by Chair Young.

Elizabeth Mumford suggested any award should be presented in the summer when most homeowners would be here, and Marilyn Fifield reminded that May is National Historic Preservation Month.

Vice Chair Clark agreed that it seemed best to plan any award for summer, and Jessica Rapp-Grasetti suggested scheduling it on the Town Council agenda for July or August.

Erin Logan noted that nominations might be sought through *The Barnstable Patriot* and the award displayed at the Historical Commission office at 200 Main Street.

Bob Frazee approved of the concept as a past award recipient, saying that everything that can educate the public would be a benefit, and he anticipated that historical societies would also be supportive.

Initial vote required to determine the applicability of Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Threshold pursuant to Cape Cod Commission Act Section 12 (c) (1) and CCC Enabling Regulations Governing the Review of Developments of Regional Impacts Chapter A, Section 2(a) (i)(a)

Marilyn Fifield noted that Chatham awards are given in conjunction with the town's historical society and require adherence to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

It was agreed that George Jessop and Elizabeth Mumford would work together to develop the concept for consideration at the Commission's April meeting.

Approval of Minutes

Marilyn Fifield moved, seconded by Cheryl Powell, to approve the February 20, 2018, minutes (Exhibit D) as edited. VOTE: Aye, Unanimous

Next meetings: April 17, 2018

May 15, 2018

With no further business before this Commission, a motion was duly made by Cheryl Powell and seconded by George Jessop to adjourn the meeting at 5:15pm.

Respectfully Submitted, Erin K. Logan, Recording Secretary and edited by Commission Clerk Marilyn Fifield

Exhibit A	Notice of Intent to Demolish	File 077/005/000
Exhibit B	Notice of Intent to Demolish	File 206/082/000
Exhibit C	Notice of Intent to Demolish	File 286/023/000
Exhibit D	Meeting Minutes	February 20, 2018