

MINUTES

**Barnstable Historical Commission
Town Hall
367 Main Street, Hyannis
Selectmen's Conference Room
February 21, 2017**

Laurie Young, Chair	ABSENT
Nancy Clark, Vice Chair	ABSENT
Marilyn Fifield, Clerk	PRESENT
Nancy Shoemaker-Acting Chair	PRESENT
George Jessop	PRESENT
Ted Wurzburg	PRESENT
Elizabeth Mumford	PRESENT
Stacey Hurwitz	Admin Assistant, GMD

Acting Chair Nancy Shoemaker called the meeting to order at 4:01 pm

Acting under the provisions of the Code of the Town of Barnstable, ss 112-1 through 112-7, the Historical Commission held a Public Hearing on the following applications previously determined significant and referred to Public Hearing:

Continued Applications:

Wenger, Robert & Bonnie, 523 Main Street, Centerville, Map 207, Parcel 049

Built c.1855-1875, Inventoried, Contributing Building in National Register Historic District

Partial demolition of single-family dwelling for addition - Continued from December 20, 2016, and January 17, 2017

Represented by Bob Wenger and Dan Lewis Architect - Elevation hand out (Exhibit B)

Mr. Wenger reported meeting with Sarah Korjeff at the Cape Cod Commission, saying she wanted to save the back eave detail & cornerboards, so plans were altered to save those details. Nancy Shoemaker read the email from Sarah Korjeff into record (Exhibit C). Mr. Lewis explained that they brought the addition back so the original portion of the house is not touched at all, with the roofline also lowered a bit to make it subservient to the house, and with the same detailing as the house, but lowered eaves. He said the addition will appear from the street to be subservient to the original building, maintaining its edge detail. George Jessop was pleased to see all 4 corners of the original house maintained and the proportions of the addition relating very well with the original building.

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, that the Barnstable Historical Commission (BHC) find and determine, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 523 Main Street, Centerville, that:

- **The property is outside a Local Historic District;**
- **The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District;**

- The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;

The BHC further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

Vote: Aye: None

Nay: All – So Voted Unanimously

Following this Nay vote, Motion is duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that the Barnstable Historical Commission find, after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and record file for the partial demolition proposed at 523 Main Street, Centerville, that this Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote: Aye: None

Nay: All – So Voted Unanimously

After this Nay vote, Motion is duly made by George Jessop and seconded by Ted Wurzburg that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the BHC determine that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 523 Main Street, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

An AYE vote would determine that the partial demolition IS NOT detrimental, imposing no demolition delay.

Vote: Aye: All – So Voted Unanimously

Nay: None

Applications:

Kuncaitis, Arunas & Denise, 253 Fuller Road, Centerville, Map 189, Parcel 071

Built 1940. Not inventoried, Not in a National Register Historic District.

Proposed construction of two-story addition and bumpout garage gable: 4' x 22', with demolition of existing screen porch.

Scott Peacock explained that the owners want to retire to the Cape and need a bigger house, saying the only place for an addition is off the back. Nancy Shoemaker clarified that the wall being demolished is technically historical.

It was also clarified that the front of the garage would be demolished and moved forward 4 feet to accommodate a car. George Jessop asked about dropping the wall 5 feet on the second floor and dormer and Mr. Peacock replied that it is only a 22 x 20, so not a huge addition, and they're trying to get as much out of it as possible. Mr. Jessop suggested dropping the wall plate on that wall back 2 feet for a step design to avoid the look of a "builder's addition."

Mr. Peacock replied that the owners have 2 kids, so are are trying to maximize the space without changing the garage style, adding that he feared changing it would lose head room. Mr. Jessop asked about repeating what is on the front of the garage, and Mr. Peacock suggested running a gutter across the front to soften it a bit. Mr. Jessop agreed with the false roof/gutter on the front to soften the two-story gable, with a nice-looking louver above.

Motion duly made by George Jessop and seconded by Elizabeth Mumford that the Barnstable Historical Commission find after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file that the Significant Building at 253 Fuller Road, Centerville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote: Aye – None; Nay – All. So Voted Unanimously

Following the Nay vote, a motion was duly made by George Jessop and seconded by Ted Wurzburg that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the BHC determines that the proposed partial demolition of the

building located at 253 Fuller Road, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town; further, that the new construction be revised in its design to reflect the proposed elevation treatment of the garage, i.e., that the first rafter be stepped back one rafter to effect a hip for the first bay, hence a gable and beginning at the second rafter, with the pitch and elevation otherwise to remain the same.

An AYE vote would determine that the partial demolition IS NOT detrimental, imposing no demolition delay.

Vote: Aye – All; Nay – None. So Voted Unanimously.

Garceau, Richard and Nortz , Thomas, 539 Main Street, Centerville, Map 207, Parcel 050

Built in 1835, Contributing Building in a National Register Historic District.

Replace three kitchen windows, add 36" x 9' door to match entrance door. Add skylight on flat roof.

Represented by Richard Garceau, Thomas Nortz, Joshua Spate (Name corrected on agenda to Thomas Nortz.)

Mr. Spate described the small renovation sought, involving an exterior door and skylight window on the driveway side of the property.

Nancy Shoemaker commended the applicants for submitting historical information with the application, although the elevation was not submitted. She asked what would be changed in the view from the street, and Mr. Spate replied that two windows would be replaced with the same kind, describing the replacement windows as Andersen and wood with fixed exterior grilles, 6 over 6 (same as what is there now).

Motion duly made by George Jessop and seconded by Ted Wurzburg that the BHC find and determine, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 539 Main Street, Centerville, that:

- The property is outside a Local Historic District;
- The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District;
- The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;

The BHC further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

Vote: Aye – None; Nay – All. So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by George Jessop and seconded by Ted Wurzburg that the Barnstable Historical Commission find after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file that the Significant Building at 539 Main Street, Centerville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote: Aye– None; Nay – All. So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the BHC determine that the partial demolition of the building located at 539 Main Street, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

Vote: Aye – All; Nay – None. So Voted Unanimously

Pozen, Daniel and Heather, 960 Main St., Cotuit, MA, Map 035 Parcel 095. Built in 1890. Contributing Building in the Cotuit National Register Historic District.

Relocate front door and replace existing deck with screen porch, new windows, new sidewall, new roof. Interior complete refinish due to fire damage.

Represented by William Picardi

Mr. Picardi explained that the existing structure doesn't really resemble anything of the original, as the inside had smoke damage (basement). He said the insurance company has ordered it to be gutted, with replacement of roofing, windows and siding. He said there are 11-foot ceilings on the first floor interior, with loft storage on the second floor, adding that it is heavy-duty construction, with 3-inch-thick flooring and timbers that were very hard to match. He said they propose to try to bring it back to some of its original condition by changing the front of the building, removing the colonial entrance and moving the entrance to the side where the farmers porch is, changing to Andersen s.d.l. windows with exterior/interior grilles, doing a woven corner (change from cornerboard corner) and replacing the roof with asphalt shingles. He said a cupola was proposed to try to return the barn look and light the center staircase, with a fake barn door on the front, disguising the transom windows, and he also noted that evergreens in the front are all being replaced.

Mr. Jessop said he would like to see a ramp with planks across the runner, and Mr. Picardi agreed, adding that they propose to make the deck a screened-in porch with cedar frame and big open screens and a wood ceiling, without changing the footprint of the house at all. He said a 24-foot sliding glass wall would separate the porch and the house, with 9 ft. high ceilings on the first floor, while the upstairs bedroom will have a 6 ft. high knee wall. Mr. Jessop asked about the flooring in the 3-season room, and Mr. Picardi replied that it would be tongue-in-groove cedar and pressure treated, run under the screening for run off, and in a no-maintenance grey color.

Motion duly made by Ted Wurzburg and seconded by Elizabeth Mumford that the BHC find and determine, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 960 Main Street, Cotuit, that:

- The property is outside a Local Historic District;
- The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District;
- The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;

The BHC further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

Vote: Aye – None; Nay – All. So Voted Unanimously.

Motion duly made by Ted Wurzburg and seconded by George Jessop that the Barnstable Historical Commission find after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file that the Significant Building at 960 Main Street, Cotuit, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote: Aye – None; Nay – All. So Voted Unanimously.

Motion duly made by Ted Wurzburg and seconded by Elizabeth Mumford that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the BHC determine that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 960 Main Street, Cotuit, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

Vote: Aye – All; Nay – None. So Voted Unanimously.

CAJ, Inc., 136 Seapuit River Road, Osterville, MA, Map 070 Parcel 003. Built in 1929. Not inventoried, Not in a National Register Historic District.

Demolish existing dwelling and construct new 4,000 square foot single-family dwelling with detached 2-car garage.

Represented by Paul Everson and Mark Curley

Mr. Everson said the roughly 4,000 sq. foot house was built in 1929 and used as a seasonal cottage in recent years, but it has suffered damage to the wiring by rodents, and squirrels have taken up residence in the house. He said the floors sag, and the general contractor determined that the cost to restore would be significantly more than to rebuild.

Nancy Shoemaker asked about the basement, and Mr. Everson replied that it has a 10x15' block foundation with mechanicals in it and a dirt floor.

Mr. Curley said it would be very difficult to repair the existing 3,998 sq. ft. home and bring it up to code and update the kitchen and tie it into the original structure, so they seek to replace it with a similar-size home.

Mr. Everson noted that it sits on an acre and a half of land, and George Jessop called it a very ordinary garrison colonial, while other Commissioners found the prospect of its demolition disappointing and felt that a demolition delay might be appropriate to give the community time to learn more of what is planned.

Mr. Jessop felt the plans could benefit from additional time, and Ms. Shoemaker suggested postponing and continuing review next month with more definitive plans. Mr. Curley replied that the house is going to come down one way or another, but agreed to continue it for one month in order to tweak the plans.

Ms. Shoemaker asked that the square footage (of both the existing and proposed house) be included on the new plans.

Motion duly made by George Jessop and seconded by Ted Wurzburg that the BHC accept a continuance for 136 Seapuit River Rd., Osterville, built in 1929, Map 070 Parcel 003, as submitted by CAJ Inc., to the March 21, 2017, meeting.

Vote: Aye: All – So Voted Unanimously

Nay: None

Burns, Sarah and Stuart, 75 Park Avenue, Centerville, MA, Map 208, Parcel 007. Built in 1920. Inventoried. Not in a National Register Historic District.

Remove rear entry from dwelling and rebuild on same footprint. Replace first-floor windows on front of dwelling.

Represented by Sarah Burns

Ms. Burns explained that this was her grandparents' home which they bought in July from her grandmother, and she said most of the updating is inside: plumbing and electrical. She said they propose to replace the existing front windows (on the ground floor) and one on the side, and then one going into the back kitchen, all similar, with 6 over 6 panes. And she said the home's deteriorating rear entry way would be replaced in the same exact footprint, although it isn't visible from the road. The Commission considered the proposed rear entry improved, and the windows were specified as Andersen tilt wash 24 x 32 for the shorter window and 24 x 36 for the larger window, with fixed white exterior and interior grilles.

There was no public comment on the proposal.

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Mumford and seconded by George Jessop that the Barnstable Historical Commission find after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file that the Significant Building at 75 Park Avenue, Centerville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote: Aye: None

Nay: All – So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Mumford and seconded by Ted Wurzburg that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the BHC determine that the proposed partial demolition of the Building located at 75 Park Avenue, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

Vote: Aye: All – So Voted Unanimously

Nay: None

Grenier, Mark, 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannisport, MA, Map 287 Parcel 081. Built in 1888. Inventoried, Contributing Building in the Hyannis Port National Register Historic District

Reconstruct tower, add bases to lower section of front and side porch columns. Move second-floor windows on south side closer together. Move front entry door one foot to the left.

Represented by Mark Grenier

Mr. Grenier reminded the Commission that he originally appeared before it last year and received approval to construct a hexagonal tower on the southeast corner. Since then, however, he said he realized it is not the appropriate design for that location, and he now proposes what he thinks is a better design. He said the size of the tower would be reduced by a foot on each side in consideration of the property's neighbor. He reminded that both this Commission and the Cape Cod Commission had approved the existing plans, but he felt the new redesign for the tower is more appropriate.

Commissioners suggested returning to confer with the Cape Cod Commission before further consideration by this Commission.

Nancy Shoemaker read into the record amendments to the Application submitted on 2/8/2017, adding that she felt this tower is better than the original one.

Neighbor Ellie Mayfield was given a copy of the amendments dated 2/8/17, and she said she never recalled seeing a tower on the house.

Ms. Shoemaker clarified that it was approved last year when this Commission accepted the Cape Cod Commission staff recommendation, and she noted that the six-sided tower would now be reduced to a smaller four-sided tower.

Mr. Grenier assured Ms. Mayfield that the front door will remain, although the half wall would be removed, and he said the door on the side (approved in 2016) may or may not be added, as he does not know what the end use of the property will be.

Shoemaker clarified what was already approved through Cape Cod Commission staff review that the Barnstable Historical Commission ratified last year (2016).

Mr. Jessop called the hexagonal tower iconic in Hyannis Port, noting four of them on the next street over, but Elizabeth Mumford felt that a tower would have been built originally if wanted then, adding that she is not happy about this look.

Ted Wurzburg observed that the Commission has already approved this as a partial demolition and asked if this should even be in front of the Commission now.

Mr. Grenier replied that he can't make changes to an approved plan, and Ms. Shoemaker reminded that the Commission can only approve demolitions and not new construction.

Mr. Jessop concluded that, essentially, the amount of material to be removed from the existing structure would be the same, and Ms. Shoemaker summarized the options as denying this application to favor the six-sided tower or approving the new four-sided tower.

Marilyn Fifield felt that Sarah Korjeff of the Cape Cod Commission should also consider these options, but Mr. Grenier said she had already seen the new plans and liked this new design much better than the first one.

Both Ms. Fifield and Mr. Wurzburg were disappointed that the Commission was not notified of her review of the revised tower plans, but it appeared that some miscommunication may have occurred during recent Town staff changes, so that past procedures were overlooked.

After discussion of all options, the Commission voted.

Motion duly made by Ted Wurzburg and seconded by George Jessop that the Barnstable Historical Commission find and determine that, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis that:

- The property is outside a Local Historic District;
- The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District;
- The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;

The BHC further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

Vote: Aye: None

Nay: Wurzburg, Fifield, Jessop, Shoemaker

Abstain: Mumford

Motion duly made by Ted Wurzburg and seconded by George Jessop that the Barnstable Historical Commission find after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for partial demolition proposed at 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, that the Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote: Aye: None

Nay: Wurzburg, Fifield, Jessop, Shoemaker

Abstain: Mumford

Motion duly made by Ted Wurzburg and seconded by George Jessop that in accordance with Section 112-3 F. the BHC determine that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

Vote: Aye: Shoemaker, Jessop, Wurzburg, Fifield

Nay: None

Abstain: Mumford

Knight, Ron, 454 Main Street, Centerville, MA, Map 208 Parcel 132. Built 1857. Inventoried. Contributing Building in a National Register Historic District.

Remove 2 windows on the third-floor gables, remove one window on first floor, remove one window on second-floor deck. Install 2 new arch-top windows in third-floor gable ends. Install a new full-view door in place of the two removed windows.

Represented by Mike Squire, Gable Building

Mr. Squire said they are seeking four things: 2 doors and 2 windows, with replacement windows resembling what is existing (6/6, inside the existing casing, with no storm panels). He said two on the upper-floor gables would be replaced with a window with a round arch, while a door would replace a window on the second floor for deck access. He confirmed "wavy glass" in the two windows to be replaced on the third floor, hoping they might be reused, and he assured Mr. Jessop that arch #2 will be one continuous upper sash, with shutters.

Nancy Shoemaker noted that William Lloyd Garrison actually visited this house, so it is very historic, but she felt what was proposed was appropriate.

Elizabeth Mumford said she has done painting at this house and feels what they are doing is great.

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Mumford & seconded by Ted Wurzburg that the Barnstable Historical Commission find and determine, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 454 Main Street, Centerville, that:

- The property is outside a Local Historic District;
- The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District;
- The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;

The BHC further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

Vote: Aye: Fifield

Nay: Jessop, Wurzburg, Mumford, Shoemaker

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Mumford and seconded by Ted Wurzburg that the Barnstable Historical Commission find after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file that the Significant Building at 454 Main Street, Centerville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote: Aye: Fifield

Nay: Shoemaker, Jessop, Wurzburg, Mumford

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Mumford and seconded by Ted Wurzburg that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the BHC determines that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 454 Main Street, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

Vote: Aye: Wurzburg, Jessop, Mumford, Shoemaker

Nay: Fifield

Correspondence and Approval of Minutes tabled to the March 21, 2017 BHC Meeting:

- Announcement of Round 23 of Massachusetts Preservation Projects Fun (MPPF) grant program
- Letter from Sarah Korjeff, Preservation Specialist with the Cape Cod Commission, regarding 554 Wianno Avenue, Osterville
- Notice from MHC 1/31/2017, Re: Baxter Grist Mill Dam Rehabilitation, West Yarmouth
- Minutes from December 20, 2016

Other Business:

- Commissioners would prefer to receive an e-packet of documents for meetings every month.
- Notes from the January meeting were amended
- George Jessop reported that Tales of Cape Cod is seeking Preservation funding, including Community Preservation funds, and Marilyn Fifield reminded that State grants are available, too.

With no further business before this Commission, a motion was duly made by Ted Wurzburg , seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, to adjourn the meeting at 6:15 pm. So Voted Unanimously.

Respectfully Submitted,

Stacey Hurwitz, Recording Secretary

Edited by Commission Clerk Marilyn Fifield

Exhibit A	Agenda dated February 21, 2016
Exhibit B	Revised Plans Submitted for 523 Main Street, Centerville 207/049
Exhibit C	Sarah Korjeff Email regarding 523 Main Street, Centerville
Exhibit D	Historic Photograph of 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannisport